

EXHIBIT B

Transcript of the Testimony of

Franklin, Mary Elizabeth

Date: September 18, 2019

Case: State of Texas, et al. v. United States of America, et al.

Bushman Court Reporting

Connie Williams

Phone: (501) 372-5115

Fax: (501) 378-0077

www.bushmanreporting.com

Page 1

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS
BROWNSVILLE DIVISION

STATE OF TEXAS, et al.,

PLAINTIFFS

v.

CASE NO. 1:18-CV-68

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, et al.,

DEFENDANTS

and

KARLA PEREZ, et al.,

DEFENDANT-INTERVENORS

and

STATE OF NEW JERSEY

DEFENDANT-INTERVENOR

DEPOSITION OF:

MARY ELIZABETH FRANKLIN

(Taken September 18th, 2019,

at 9:01 a.m.)

Page 2

1 APPEARANCES

2 ON BEHALF OF THE PLAINTIFFS, ET AL.:

3 TODD L. DISHER, ESQUIRE
Trial Counsel for Civil Litigation
4 P.O. Box 12548
Austin, Texas 78711-2548
5 Telephone: 512.936.2266
E-mail: todd.disher@oag.texas.gov

6 ON BEHALF OF THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,
7 et al.:

8 JIM BRADER, CHIEF DEPUTY COUNSEL
Donaghey Plaza South
9 700 Main Street
Little Rock, Arkansas 72203-1437
10 Telephone: 501.682.1363
E-mail: jim.brader@dhs.arkansas.gov

11 ON BEHALF OF KARLA PEREZ, et al.:

12 NINA PERALES, ESQUIRE
RAMON A. SOTO, ESQUIRE
13 MALDEF
14 110 Broadway, Suite 300
San Antonio, Texas 78205
15 Telephone: 210.224.5476
E-mail: nperales@maldef.org
rsoto@maldef.org

16 ON BEHALF OF THE STATE OF NEW JERSEY:

17 JEREMY E. HOLLANDER, ESQUIRE (via telephone)
Assistant Attorney General
18 Office of the Attorney General of New Jersey
25 Market Street, 8th Floor
20 Trenton, New Jersey 08625
E-mail: jeremy.hollander@law.njoag.gov

21 ALSO PRESENT:

22 ATTORNEY GENERAL LESLIE RUTLEDGE
DYLAN L. JACOBS, Assistant Solicitor General
23 323 Center Street, Suite 200
Little Rock, Arkansas 72201
24 Email: Dylan.Jacobs@arkansasag.gov

Page 71

1 Is that right?

2 A Yes.

3 Q And was there an attachment to that e-mail where
4 Ms. Ashley sends you an attachment?

5 A Yes, that was this [indicating].

6 Q Exhibit 4?

7 A Yes.

8 Q Okay. And then it looks like I see an e-mail above
9 that where you're sending a communication. You're
10 sending an e-mail to Mr. Jacobs; is that right?

11 A Yes.

12 Q That's dated September 3rd?

13 A Yes.

14 Q And was there an attachment to this e-mail?

15 A No. At this point he just got the chain.

16 Q I understand.

17 A He just got the chain, not all the attachments
18 within the chain.

19 MS. PERALES: Okay. So at this point I'd
20 like to request of counsel that we receive the
21 attachments that were associated with these
22 e-mails.

23 MR. DISHER: We will certainly discuss
24 that and look at the attachments and then
25 communicate that back to you whether we can

Page 72

1 produce that. But we'll take a look at it for
2 sure.

3 MS. PERALES: Thank you.

4 MR. DISHER: And presumably there will be
5 redactions that have to be done.

6 MS. PERALES: Understood.

7 BY MS. PERALES:

8 Q We have two more e-mail strings associated with
9 this exhibit, and it looks like there might be a little
10 bit of an overlap in some of the e-mails.

11 So if we turn to Bates 441, which is the
12 beginning of that second string, we see an e-mail from
13 Ms. Ashley to you on July 26. That looks like the same
14 e-mail that we see on Bates 439. But I just wanted you
15 to confirm that for me.

16 A Yes.

17 Q Then behind that, on Bates page 442, it looks like
18 the same e-mail that we see on Bates 439; is that right?

19 A Yes.

20 Q So we've already talked about those.

21 And then, of course, I see across the top that
22 you're sending these e-mails to Mr. Jacobs with an FYI,
23 right?

24 A Yes.

25 Q Then, finally, let's turn to Bates 443, which is

Page 96

1 Exhibit 4 without the claims column.

2 Q Sure.

3 A It's not here.

4 Q And I also don't have the unredacted version --

5 A That's correct.

6 Q -- which I presume at some point passes through
7 you?

8 A Yes.

9 Q Did you receive any other documents that were
10 either explanatory to what you were receiving, or were
11 like backup runs, or anything like that?

12 A No.

13 Q Did you bring any documents explaining for
14 Exhibit 4 how much of the amounts represented in the
15 final column total paid amount were reimbursed at 100
16 percent by CHIP?

17 A No.

18 Q Did you bring any documents showing how the DACA
19 designation is communicated to your eligibility system
20 by the VLP?

21 A No.

22 MS. PERALES: You mentioned earlier that
23 there was a key of status codes, I guess, for
24 lack of a better word. I believe that that
25 key would be responsive to the subpoena duces

Page 97

1 tecum. And so I'd like to ask for the
2 production of the key.

3 MR. DISHER: We will look at the key and
4 evaluate to the extent that we have it. I've
5 never seen it. And so we'll see if we can
6 find it and we'll take a look at it and we'll
7 communicate with you about it.

8 MS. PERALES: Okay. Thank you.

9 I'd also like to request if there's any
10 document, other than the key document, that
11 shows us how DACA-related information is
12 communicated out of the hub or out of the VLP
13 to the state eligibility system.

14 MR. DISHER: I understand.

15 MS. PERALES: We need a minute.

16 MR. DISHER: Sure.

17 (A recess was taken from 12:18 p.m. to
18 12:24 p.m.)

19 MS. PERALES: I pass the witness.

20 MR. DISHER: Jeremy, do you have any
21 questions?

22 MR. HOLLANDER: No, not at this time.

23 EXAMINATION

24 BY MR. DISHER:

25 Q First I want to talk about the CHIP reimbursement

Page 105

1 C E R T I F I C A T E
2
3 STATE OF ARKANSAS)
4)
5 COUNTY OF PERRY)
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

I, Connie M. Williams, Certified Court Reporter and Notary Public, do hereby certify that the facts stated by me in the caption on the foregoing proceedings are true; and that the foregoing proceedings were reported verbatim through the use of the stenographic method and thereafter transcribed by me or under my direct supervision to the best of my ability, taken at the time and place set out on the caption hereto.

I further certify that in accordance with Rule 30(e) of the Rules of Civil Procedure, review of the transcript was requested by the deponent or a party thereto.

I further certify that I am not a relative or employee of any attorney or employed by the parties hereto, nor financially interested in the outcome of this action, and that I have no contract with the parties, attorneys, or persons with an interest in the action that affects or has a substantial tendency to affect impartiality, that requires me to relinquish control of an original deposition transcript or copies of the transcript before it is certified and delivered to the custodial attorney, or that requires me to provide any service not made available to all parties to the action.

WITNESS MY HAND AND SEAL this 1st day of October, 2019.



CONNIE M. WILLIAMS
CCR, LS No. 750, Notary Public in
and for Perry County, Arkansas
My Commission Expires 5/2/23

Page 106

1

SIGNATURE OF DEPONENT CERTIFICATE

2

I, MARY ELIZABETH FRANKLIN, do hereby certify
that I have read the foregoing deposition, taken on
September 18th, 2019, and that, to the best of my
knowledge and belief, said deposition is true and
accurate with the exception of the following corrections
listed below:

5

PAGE LINE CORRECTION

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

Date: _____

22

Witness Signature: _____

STATE OF _____

COUNTY OF _____

23

SUBSCRIBED AND SWORN TO before me this
day of _____, 2019.

24

My Commission expires: _____

25

Notary Public: _____